## Chapter 11

## Replacement Analysis

## Problem 4 page 533

The Container Corporation of America is considering replacing an automatic painting machine purchased 9 years ago for $\$ 700,000$. It has a market value today of $\$ 40,000$. The unit costs $\$ 350,000$ annually to operate and maintain. A new unit can be purchased for $\$ 800,000$ and will have annual O\&M costs of $\$ 120,000$. If the old unit is retained, it will have no salvage value at the end of its remaining life of 10 years. The new unit, if purchased, will have a salvage value of $\$ 100,000$ in 10 years. Using an AW measure and a MARR of 20 percent to see if the automatic painting machine should be replaced if it is taken as a trade-in for its market value of $\$ 40,000$.
i. Use the cash flow approach (insider's viewpoint approach).
ii. Use the opportunity cost approach (outsider's viewpoint approach)

## $\square$ Cash Flow Approach (insider's viewpoint approach).

## Defender


$\mathrm{AW}_{1}(20 \%)=-\$ 350,000 / \mathrm{year}$ $\$ 350,000$ / year

$\mathrm{AW}_{2}(20 \%)=-\$ 760,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{P} 20 \%, 10)+\$ 100,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{F} 20 \%, 10)-\$ 120,000$
$\mathrm{AW}_{2}(20 \%)=-\$ 760,000(0.23852)+\$ 100,000(0.03852)-\$ 120,000=-\$ 297423.2 / \mathrm{year}$
Replace with new painting machine

## $\square$ Cash Flow Approach (insider's viewpoint approach).

## Defender



EUAC $_{1}(20 \%)=\$ 350,000 /$ year $\$ 350,000$ / year

$\operatorname{EUAC}_{2}(20 \%)=\$ 760,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{P} 20 \%, 10)-\$ 100,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{F} 20 \%, 10)+\$ 120,000$ EUAC $_{2}(20 \%)=\$ 297423.2 /$ year

Replace with new painting machine
$\square$ Opportunity Cost Approach (outsider's viewpoint approach).

Defender

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \begin{array}{ll|l|l|l|l|l|l|l|l|l}
\hline & 1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & 6 & 7 & 8 & 9 & 10
\end{array} \\
& \$ 350,000 \text { / year }
\end{aligned}
$$

$\$ 40,000$
$\mathrm{AW}_{1}(20 \%)=-\$ 350,000-\$ 40,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{P} 20 \%, 10)=-\$ 359,540 /$ year
$\$ 100,000$

Challenger

$\mathrm{AW}_{2}(20 \%)=-\$ 800,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{P} 20 \%, 10)+\$ 100,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{F} 20 \%, 10)-\$ 120,000$
$\mathrm{AW}_{2}(20 \%)=-\$ 306,964 /$ year


Replace with new painting machine

## Problem 8 page 534

Dell is considering replacing one of its material handling systems. It has an annual O\&M cost of $\$ 48,000$, a remaining operational life of 8 years, and an estimated salvage value of $\$ 6,000$ at that time. A new system can be purchased for $\$ 175,000$. It will be worth $\$ 50,000$ in 8 years, and it will have annual O\&M costs of only $\$ 17,000$ per year due to new technology. If the new system is purchased, the old system will be traded in for $\$ 55,000$, even though the old system can be sold for only $\$ 45,000$ on the open market. Leasing a new system will cost $\$ 31,000$ per year, payable at the beginning of the year, plus operating costs of $\$ 15,000$ per year payable at year-end. If the new system is leased, the existing material handling system will be sold for its market value of $\$ 45,000$. Use an 8 -year planning horizon, an annual worth analysis, and MARR of 15 percent to decide which material handling system to recommend: (1) keep existing, (2) trade in existing and purchase new, or (3) sell existing and lease.
i. Use the cash flow approach (insider's viewpoint approach).
ii. Use the opportunity cost approach (outsider's viewpoint approach)
$\square$ Cash Flow Approach (insider's viewpoint approach).

## Defender


$\mathrm{AW}_{1}(20 \%)=-\$ 48,000+\$ 6,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{F} 15 \%, 8)=-\$ 47,562.9 /$ year

$\mathrm{AW}_{2}(20 \%)=-\$ 120,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{P} 15 \%, 8)+\$ 500,00(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{F} 15 \%, 8)-\$ 17,000=-\$ 40,099.5 /$ year
$\square$ Cash Flow Approach (insider's viewpoint approach).
Lease

$\mathrm{AW}_{3}(20 \%)=[\$ 14,000-\$ 46000$ (P/A 15\%,7)- 15,000 (P/F $\left.15 \%, 8)\right](\mathrm{A} / \mathrm{P} 15 \%, 8)$
$\mathrm{AW}_{3}(20 \%)=-\$ 40621.72$ / year Trade in existing and purchase new system
$\square$ Opportunity Cost Approach (outsider's viewpoint approach).

Defender

$\mathrm{AW}_{1}(20 \%)=-\$ 45,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{P} 15 \%, 8)-\$ 48,000+\$ 6,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{F} 15 \%, 8)=-\$ 57,591 /$ year
$\$ 10,000 \quad \$ 50,000$
Challenger

$\mathrm{AW}_{2}(20 \%)=-\$ 165,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{P} 15 \%, 8)+\$ 50,000(\mathrm{~A} / \mathrm{F} 15 \%, 8)-\$ 17,000=-\$ 50,127 /$ year
$\square$ Opportunity Cost Approach (outsider's viewpoint approach).

Lease

$\mathrm{AW}_{3}(20 \%)=[-\$ 31,000-\$ 46000(\mathrm{P} / \mathrm{A} 15 \%, 7)-\$ 15,000(\mathrm{P} / \mathrm{F} 15 \%, 8)](\mathrm{A} / \mathrm{P} 15 \%, 8)$
$\mathrm{AW}_{3}(20 \%)=\$ 50649 /$ year
Trade in existing and purchase new system

